

Appendix C

The Militiamen

THE FOLLOWING IS a list of men in the Iron Military District of Utah Territory's Nauvoo Legion militia whose names have been associated with the Mountain Meadows Massacre. The names have been gathered from a variety of sources including eyewitness accounts, arrest warrants and criminal indictments, and newspaper articles.

A completely accurate list of those who participated in or witnessed the murders of the California-bound emigrants may be impossible to compile. Many of the participants kept silent about their roles. The testimonies of many witnesses were given fifteen years or more after the massacre. Those who admitted being at the massacre were usually careful not to incriminate themselves and their closest associates.

The names are organized in alphabetical order. Each entry includes life span, as well as age, militia rank, and residence at the time of the massacre.¹ Because of the varying credibility of evidence, a note of *[A]* or *[B]* has been placed after each individual's name and age; *[A]* indicates there is strong evidence the individual planned, authorized, participated in, or witnessed the killing of emigrants, and *[B]* indicates that the evidence is inconclusive. Men whose names have been associated with the massacre are not listed if there is little or no evidence to support that association.²

For additional information on the militiamen, see mountainmeadowsmassacre.org.

Adair, George Washington, Jr. (1837–1909), 20. [A] Private, Company I, Fifth Platoon, Washington City. One of the nine men indicted for the massacre. Adair admitted going to Mountain Meadows and was present for the massacre. He may have also been used as a messenger between the Meadows and Cedar City.³

Allen, Ira (1814–1900), 43. [A] Second Lieutenant, Company E, Fifth Platoon, Cedar City. At the September 6 council meeting, he sided with Isaac Haight's plan to destroy the emigrant company. He was one of the men on horseback during the final massacre whose orders were to catch and kill emigrants who attempted to escape the slaughter.⁴

Arthur, Benjamin A. (1834–83), 23. [A] Sergeant, Company D, Fourth Platoon, Cedar City. He was one of three men John M. Higbee sent to the Meadows to watch the emigrants. John D. Lee reported Arthur present when William Stewart and Joel White killed emigrant William Aden. Arthur was at the Meadows for the final massacre, though Elliott Willden claimed he was unarmed.⁵

Arthur, Christopher Jones (1832–1918), 25. [B] Adjutant, Company G, Cedar City. The son-in-law of Isaac C. Haight, he arrived at the Meadows with Elias Morris shortly after the massacre ended.⁶

Bateman, William (1824–69), 33. [A] Sergeant, Company G, Fourth Platoon, Cedar City. Prior to the massacre, he carried the white flag to the emigrants' corral.⁷

Cartwright, Thomas Henry (1814–73), 42. [A] Private, Company D, Fourth Platoon, Cedar City. Samuel Pollock recalled traveling with him to the Meadows.⁸

Clark, John Wesley (1818–69), 39. [A] Private, Company I, Third Platoon, Washington City. He was part of the Washington group that arrived at the Meadows on Tuesday morning.⁹

Clewes, Joseph (1831–94), 25. [B] Private, Company F, First Platoon, Cedar City. He served as a messenger between the Meadows and Cedar City. He left the Meadows before the final massacre but may have witnessed the killing of two emigrants near Leach's Spring on Tuesday.¹⁰

Coleman, Prime Thornton (1831–1905), 25. [B] Private, Company H, First Platoon, Fort Clara. Coleman admitted to massacre

investigator James H. Carleton that he went with Ira Hatch toward the Muddy River and saw the footprints of three emigrants who escaped from Mountain Meadows. His statement led Carleton to believe that he assisted Hatch in tracking and killing those men.¹¹

Curtis, Ezra Houghton (1822–1915), 35. [A] Second Lieutenant, Company E, First Platoon, Cedar City. Samuel Pollock said Curtis ordered him to go to Mountain Meadows. Curtis was seen by Lee at the Meadows with other militia officers before the massacre.¹²

Dame, William Horne (1819–84), 38. [A] Colonel, Iron Military District, Parowan. One of the nine men indicted for the massacre. As the senior militia officer in southern Utah, he originally directed Haight not to attack the emigrants. During the early morning hours of Thursday, September 10, however, he consented to their death. He argued with Haight after the massacre over how the killings would be reported to authorities.¹³

Dickson, Robert (b. 1807), 50. [B] Private, Company H, Third Platoon, Pinto. Albert Hamblin recalled seeing Dickson with other Pinto men at Hamblin's ranch during the week of the massacre.¹⁴

Durfee, Jabez (1828–83), 29. [B] Private, Company E, First Platoon, Cedar City. Only Lee's memoirs place Durfee at Mountain Meadows before the massacre.¹⁵

Edwards, William (1841–1925), 15. [A] Cedar City. Too young to serve officially in the militia, Edwards admitted he was at the massacre, though he claimed he was drawn there under false pretense to bury the dead from an Indian massacre. Edwards also claimed that he "with many of the other white men refused to discharge his weapon."¹⁶

Freeman, Columbus Reed (1838–1907), 19. [A] Private, Company C, Fifth Platoon, Parowan. Though listed on Parowan militia rolls in June 1857, Freeman may have gone to the Meadows from Washington, where his parents and siblings were living at the time of the massacre.¹⁷

Haight, Isaac Chauncey (1813–86), 44. [A] Major, Second Battalion, Cedar City. One of the nine men indicted for the massacre. Even though he was not at the massacre itself, he was a chief leader in its planning and execution. He sent the militiamen to the Meadows and obtained approval from Colonel William Dame for the emigrants' destruction.¹⁸

Hamblin, Oscar (1833–62), 24. [B] Second Lieutenant, Company H, Second Platoon, Fort Clara. He apparently recruited Paiutes along the Santa Clara River and acted as an interpreter at the Meadows, at least until Tuesday, September 8. Oscar's brother, Jacob, maintained that Oscar brought Indians to Mountain Meadows and then left.¹⁹

Harrison, Richard (1808–82), 49. [A] Second Lieutenant, Company E, Third Platoon, Cedar City. Frank Jordan, a stepson of Harrison, recalled him leaving Cedar City with other militiamen. Lee saw Harrison at Mountain Meadows on Thursday, September 10.²⁰

Hatch, Ira (1835–1909), 22. [A] Private, Company H, First Platoon, Fort Clara. Hatch was not at the massacre, but he reportedly led Indians in tracking and killing three emigrants who escaped the siege site before the main slaughter on Friday.²¹

Hawley, George (1824–1905), 32. [B] Sergeant, Company I, Fourth Platoon, Washington City. Although Hawley's brothers John and William are often named as massacre participants, only one list, attributed to Lee, identified George at the massacre.²²

Hawley, John Pierce (1826–1909), 31. [B] Sergeant, Company I, Fifth Platoon, Washington City. Lee said John Hawley was with the group of men from Washington. Hawley denied Lee's assertion and later claimed to have spoken publicly to Lee and others against the massacre after it was over.²³

Hawley, William Schroeder (1829–93), 27. [A] Sergeant, Company I, Second Platoon, Washington City. Lee claimed he was with the Washington group that arrived at the Meadows on Tuesday, September 8.²⁴

Higbee, John Mount (1827–1904), 30. [A] Major, Third Battalion, Cedar City. One of the nine men indicted for the massacre. Higbee led two groups of massacre participants to the Meadows from Cedar City. On Thursday night he carried the orders for the emigrants' destruction, and on Friday he gave the signal for the massacre to begin.²⁵

Hopkins, Charles (1810–63), 47. [A] Private, Company D, First Platoon, Cedar City. Despite his rank, Hopkins was considered one of the leaders at the massacre, probably because of his relatively senior age, prominence in the community, and military experience.²⁶

Humphries, John Samuel (1825–1903), 31. [A] Musician, Company F, Cedar City. Although several lists of massacre participants identify Humphries, they give no specifics about his role.²⁷

Hunter, George (1828–82), 29. [A] Sergeant, Company D, First Platoon, Cedar City. He was seen at the Meadows by witnesses before and after the massacre.²⁸

Jacobs, John (1825–1919), 31. [B] Private, Company E, Fourth Platoon, Cedar City. Although Lee claimed John Jacobs was at Mountain Meadows shortly before the massacre, Jacobs wrote to the *Salt Lake Daily Herald*, “I was not there at all, nor indeed within thirty-five miles of the place at the time.”²⁹

Jacobs, Swen (1823–91), 33. [A] Second Lieutenant, Company E, Fourth Platoon, Cedar City. He was identified as being at the Meadows by John D. Lee and Philip Klingensmith.³⁰

Jewkes, Samuel (1823–1900), 34. [B] Musician, Company E, Cedar City. One of the nine men indicted for the massacre, Jewkes was identified in Lee’s memoirs as being at the massacre. Other information, however, casts some doubt on the claim.³¹

Johnson, Nephi (1833–1919), 23. [A] Second Lieutenant, Company D, Second Platoon, Fort Johnson. He acted as a Paiute language interpreter at the Meadows and gave the orders on Friday for Indians to attack.³²

Klingensmith, Philip (1815–81?), 42. [A] Private, Company D, First Platoon, Cedar City. One of the nine men indicted for the massacre. Though only a private, he was considered a key supporter of the massacre and used his role as local bishop to exert his influence. Traveling to the Meadows late Tuesday, September 8, he killed one of two emigrants found in the cedars near Leach’s Spring. He admitted shooting one of the emigrant men on Friday. He also reportedly had at least one of the children killed. Klingensmith turned state’s evidence and thereby avoided prosecution.³³

Knight, Samuel (1832–1910), 24. [A] Private, Company H, Second Platoon, Fort Clara. He drove one of the wagons that carried the wounded and small children. Although Lee said Knight helped kill those in the wagons, Knight and Nephi Johnson claimed he was busy calming his horses, which were startled by gunshots.³⁴

Leavitt, Dudley (1830–1908), 27. [B] Private, Company H, First Platoon, Fort Clara. Leavitt’s son Henry said of his father’s role in the massacre, “It was always my understanding that father was one of the scouts who rode horseback with messages back and forth,” though

no other sources confirm it. Historian Juanita Brooks recalled that Leavitt, her grandfather, said, “I thank God that these old hands have never been stained by human blood.”³⁵

Lee, John Doyle (1812–77), 45. [A] Major, Fourth Battalion, Harmony. Lee was the only person tried and executed for his role in the massacre. He led the first attack on the emigrants. He negotiated the emigrants’ surrender and helped kill those in the two lead wagons. Although he reportedly admitted killing five or six emigrants, his confessions, published posthumously by prosecuting attorney Sumner Howard and Lee’s defense attorney William Bishop, maintained that he objected to what was done and did not kill anyone.³⁶

Loveridge, Alexander Hamilton (1828–1905), 29. [A] Sergeant, Company F, Third Platoon, Cedar City. He was seen leaving Cedar City with other militiamen bound for the Meadows.³⁷

Macfarlane, Daniel Sinclair (1837–1914), 20. [A] Adjutant, Company D, Cedar City. He rode at the head of the women and children and behind the lead wagons just before the Friday slaughter. As one of the few horsemen, Macfarlane was to round in any emigrants who tried to escape.³⁸

Macfarlane, John Menzies (1833–92), 23. [B] Adjutant, Second Battalion, Cedar City. There is debate about whether John Macfarlane was at the massacre. Judge John Cradlebaugh issued a warrant for his arrest in 1859. Lee’s confession in *Mormonism Unveiled* asserts Macfarlane’s presence, but with some uncertainty.³⁹ Macfarlane served as an attorney on the defense team for Dame and Lee in 1875, and there is speculation that Lee’s attorney and editor, William Bishop, added Macfarlane’s name to Lee’s original manuscript because of a personal dislike for him.

McMurdy, Samuel (1830–1922), 26. [A] Private, Company E, First Platoon, Cedar City. During the final massacre, he drove the lead wagon and may have assisted Lee in killing those in it.⁴⁰

Mangum, James Mitchell (1820–88), 37. [A] Private, Company I, Fourth Platoon, Washington City. James Mangum claimed he was recruited to go to Mountain Meadows by Carl Shirts to help with Indians but returned home after the Indians threatened his life. William Young, however, recalled returning to Washington with Mangum after the massacre.⁴¹

Mangum, John (1817–85), 40. [B] Private, Company I, Fourth Platoon, Washington City. Lee’s memoirs say that John Mangum helped him talk to Paiutes at Mountain Meadows before the massacre but may have mistaken James for John.⁴²

Mathews, James Nicholas (1827–71), 30. [B] Second Lieutenant, Company I, Second Platoon, Washington City. Lee was the only witness who identified Mathews, saying he saw him with the other men from Washington on Monday night.⁴³

Morris, Elias (1825–98), 32. [A] Captain, Company E, Cedar City. Though he did not go to the Meadows until after the massacre was over, he was with Haight at key planning meetings, including the “tan bark council” in which Dame approved destroying the emigrants.⁴⁴

Pearce, Harrison (1818–89), 38. [A] Captain, Company I, Washington City. Pearce led militiamen from Washington toward Mountain Meadows on Monday, arriving the next day. John Hawley recalled Harrison Pearce making inflammatory speeches against non-Mormons in a public meeting after the massacre.⁴⁵

Pearce, James (1839–1922), 18. [A] Private, Company I, Fifth Platoon, Washington City. Though Pearce was at the Meadows during the week of the massacre, he remained at the militia encampment due to illness during Friday’s final slaughter.⁴⁶

Pollock, Samuel (1824–91), 33. [A] Sergeant, Company E, First Platoon, Cedar City. Pollock witnessed the massacre from in or near the militia campsite, where he may have been on guard duty.⁴⁷

Reeves, Josiah (1835–1914), 21. [B] Private, Company G, First Platoon, Cedar City. One of three men sent by Higbee to the Meadows to watch the emigrants. When his brother-in-law Samuel Pollock passed Hamblin’s ranch, he noticed Reeves keeping Mormon stock apart from the emigrants’ scattered stock.⁴⁸ It is unclear where Reeves was during Friday’s massacre.

Riddle, Isaac (1830–1906), 27. [B] Private, Company H, Fourth Platoon, Harmony. He was in Cedar City on Tuesday when Haight suddenly sent him back to his home in Pine Valley. While traveling home, he overtook Higbee’s detachment headed for the Meadows and may have witnessed the murder of two emigrants who had gone to seek help.⁴⁹

Robinson, Richard Smith (1830–1902), 26. [B] Second Lieutenant, Company H, Third Platoon, Pinto. Since he was considered the leader of the Pinto settlement, he received messages from Cedar City during the days leading to the massacre. Albert Hamblin saw him at Mountain Meadows during the week of the massacre.⁵⁰

Shirts, Don Carlos (Carl) (1836–1922), 21. [A] Second Lieutenant, Company H, Fourth Platoon, Harmony. At the time a son-in-law of Lee, Shirts was sent by him to recruit Paiutes as part of the original plan to attack the emigrants. Shirts also played a role in instructing Paiutes for the final massacre.⁵¹

Slade, William Rufus, Sr. (1811–72), 46. [A] Private, Company I, Third Platoon, Washington City. Klingensmith remembered talking to William Slade Sr. at the Meadows just before the final massacre.⁵²

Slade, William, Jr. (1834–1902), 23. [A] Sergeant, Company I, Third Platoon, Washington City. William Slade Jr. was seen by Lee and Klingensmith at the Meadows before the massacre.⁵³

Smith, Joseph Hodgetts (1819–90), 38. [B] Private, Company F, First Platoon, Cedar City. A list of massacre participants attributed to Lee and released to the public by his attorney William Bishop identified “Joseph Smith, of Cedar City.” However, Lee makes no mention of Smith in his published confessions, nor is there mention of Smith in any other eyewitness accounts.⁵⁴

Spencer, George (1829–72), 27. [A] Adjutant, Company I, Washington City. In 1867 Spencer wrote to Mormon apostle Erastus Snow confessing that he was “in that horrid ‘Mountain Meadow affair.’” An 1875 article called Spencer a “mono-maniac” about the massacre, explaining that “he talked constantly of the part he had enacted in the frightful tragedy.”⁵⁵

Stewart, William Cameron (1827–95), 30. [A] Second Lieutenant, Company F, First Platoon, Cedar City. One of nine men indicted for the massacre. Stewart killed emigrant William Aden on Monday and during the final massacre on Friday broke from the ranks to chase and kill emigrants who survived the initial volley of bullets.⁵⁶

Stoddard, David Kerr (1830–1913), 27. [B] Musician, Company F, Cedar City. Although no eyewitnesses saw him at the Mountain Meadows, Stoddard’s neighbor John Bradshaw recalled seeing him at Cedar City with other men mustered to go to the Meadows.⁵⁷

Stratton, Anthony Johnson (1824–87), 33. [A] Second Lieutenant, Company E, Second Platoon, Cedar City. John D. Lee identified Anthony Stratton with other militia recruits from Cedar City at the Meadows the night before the final massacre.⁵⁸

Tait, William (1818–96), 38. [A] Captain, Company F, Cedar City. A former drill master in the British Army, Tait was one of the few men in the Iron Military District with formal military training. Tait admitted being at the massacre on Friday but claimed that he and his men didn't kill anyone.⁵⁹

Thornton, Amos Griswold (1832–1902), 24. [B] Sergeant, Company H, Third Platoon, Pinto. Albert Hamblin recalled seeing him at Hamblin's ranch during the week of the massacre, likely to deliver the message Joseph Clewes gave him at Pinto.⁶⁰

Tullis, David Wilson (1833–1902), 24. [A] Private, Company H, First Platoon, Fort Clara. One of the surviving children, six-year-old Rebecca Dunlap, reportedly identified an "Englishman named Tullis" as having killed one of her parents. According to Albert Hamblin, after the massacre Tullis transported the surviving children from the massacre site to Hamblin's ranch.⁶¹

Urie, John Main (1835–1921), 22. [A] Adjutant, Third Battalion, Cedar City. Lee said Urie was at the Meadows on the night before the massacre. After the massacre, Urie guarded the emigrants' property and later helped transport it to Cedar City.⁶²

Western, John (1807–65), 49. [B] Sergeant, Company F, First Platoon, Cedar City. Some accounts name "John Weston" as a massacre participant.⁶³ Although the name is difficult to decipher in the shorthand of the second Lee trial, Nephi Johnson recalled a John "Weyson," "Weeson," or "Reeson" taking a wagon to Mountain Meadows the night before the massacre. In longhand transcriptions of the trial, the name was recorded as "Weston" or "Western," an inaccurate reflection of the original shorthand.⁶⁴ No one named Weston is known to have lived in southern Utah in 1857. "John Western" is the closest name, but evidence of Western's participation is inconclusive.⁶⁵ Johnson may have been referring to John Willis.⁶⁶

White, Joel William (1831–1914), 26. [A] Captain, Company D, Cedar City. White wounded another emigrant when William Aden was murdered on Monday, September 7. Although White claimed he did not have a gun for Friday's massacre, Elliott Willden claimed he

broke ranks to chase after and kill emigrants who survived the initial gunshots.⁶⁷

White, Samuel Dennis (1818–68), 39. [B] Private, Company F, Fifth Platoon, Fort Sidon [Hamilton's Fort]. Although Samuel White was identified as a massacre participant in lists released to the public by Lee's attorney William Bishop, Lee made no mention of Samuel White in his published confessions.⁶⁸

Wiley, Robert (1809–72), 47. [A] Sergeant, Company E, Third Platoon, Cedar City. Shortly before the massacre, Wiley met with Lee, Klingensmith, and other leaders at Hamblin's ranch.⁶⁹

Willden, Elliott (1833–1920), 23. [A] Private, Company F, Fourth Platoon, Cedar City. One of the nine men indicted for the massacre. Willden and two others were sent by Higbee to the Meadows to watch the emigrants. Willden claimed to be unarmed at the Friday massacre, though Lee said that earlier in the week Willden fired his gun toward the emigrant camp. Willden owned the pistols William Stewart borrowed to kill William Aden.⁷⁰

Williamson, James (1813–69), 44. [A] Private, Company D, First Platoon, Cedar City. Joel White said Williamson traveled to Mountain Meadows with him.⁷¹

Willis, John Henry (1835–88), 22. [B] Second Lieutenant, Company G, First Platoon, Cedar City. Though Willis insisted he did not go to the Meadows until after the massacre, Klingensmith said he took his wagon and team to the Meadows the night before.⁷² Klingensmith could not remember if Willis joined the militiamen at the massacre or remained at Hamblin's ranch.⁷³ Massacre survivor Nancy Saphrona Huff lived with Willis's family until 1859 and remembered him taking her from the massacre site.⁷⁴

Young, William (1805–75), 52. [A] Private, Company I, Fourth Platoon, Washington City. The eldest militiaman at Mountain Meadows, he remained at the militia encampment and witnessed the massacre from a nearby hill.⁷⁵